

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* **MENTAL SUGGESTION**

by
Frederick Dixon, C.S.B.
in the Weekly Budget,
London, England

Published as a pamphlet by The Christian Science Publishing Society
in 1912 and now in the public domain.

Published in e-book transcription and presented as a gift of love by
cslectures.org

*"The 'still, small voice' of scientific thought reaches
over continent and ocean to the globe's remotest bound.
The inaudible voice of Truth is, to the human mind,
'as when a lion roareth.'"*
— Mary Baker Eddy

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

THERE is, perhaps, no question occupying the attention of the public today, a correct understanding of which is more essential to its welfare, than that which is summed up in the phrase "mental healing." It is, therefore, peculiarly desirable that, at a time when this treatment is surely and rapidly taking its place as a recognized therapeutic medium, some explanation of such antithetic systems as Christian Science and mental suggestion should be forthcoming.

Mental suggestion is by no means the new discovery that the "man in the street" is apt to regard it. It is as old as the human mind, and is based on that inherent tendency toward a belief in dualism which seems to hypnotize the race. The dualism ultimately resolves itself into a belief in good and evil, a belief which found expression in the metaphor of the tree in the Jehovistic document of Genesis. If the admission is once made that, speaking absolutely, evil is not real, the deduction that the human mind, with its claim of intelligence, will-power, thought-transference — in short, of suggestion in any form — is not a factor in spiritual healing, must inevitably follow.

That mental suggestion, from a standpoint of relative truth, may produce certain changes in a human mentality or in physical conditions is nothing to the point. It only proves that certain effects follow, under certain conditions, until a better knowledge of law enables you to ignore these conditions which are imposed by ignorance.

LIMITATIONS, NOT LAWS

The primitive man, for instance, crept round his coasts in a canoe. Gradually the canoe developed into a galley, in which longer

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

voyages in more difficult circumstances became a possibility. The evolution of the sailing ship led to the discarding of the galley, but still human efforts were limited by the laws imposed by tides and winds. The era of the steamship overcame the restrictions which had existed for sailing ships. What had appeared to be laws were found to be nothing more than the limitations of ignorance. Men began to perceive that they had been battling not so much against the laws of nature as against their own self-imposed beliefs of time and space.

To Mrs. Eddy it occurred that the gospels recorded a fact always passed over as supernatural and impractical — the fact that Jesus had carried the boat across the lake in an instant. It was an indication of spiritual law which must have struck her in the way that the steam issuing from the kettle appealed to Watt's perception of physical law, and it was only one indication among many. All that followed, to a person of her intense spiritual alertness, was not only natural: it was inevitable. Huxley once said that when a physical phenomenon is observed which appears contrary to an existing acceptance of law, it is more intelligent to recognize a result of a hitherto unsuspected law than to proceed to acclaim a miracle. In the Bible Mrs. Eddy found the record of numerous phenomena which the world had learned to regard as supernatural violations of law. She knew, however, that a violated law never had been a law, therefore some other explanation was necessary. She forestalled Huxley's advice, and recorded her action in that well-known passage, on page 109 of *Science and Health*: "I knew the Principle of all harmonious Mind-action to be God, and that cures were produced in primitive Christian healing by holy, uplifting faith; but I must know the Science of this healing, and I won my way to absolute conclusions through divine revelation, reason, and demonstration."

BELIEF IN DUALISM

This discovery of the Science of spiritual law which Jesus taught in his theology and demonstrated in his miracles or object-lessons brought with it the perception that the ignorance of that law

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

constituted the belief in the counterfeit comprised in material law. Now, the admission that material law is the expression of the absolute reduces man to the acceptance of the dualism which acknowledges good and evil as power. It is consequently necessary to show that evil is only an expression of human ignorance, the belief in which can be corrected and destroyed by that knowledge of absolute Truth which Jesus said would free the world; and what could it free it from but ignorance?

The primitive man, ignorant of what is called physical law, listening to the thunder crashing amid the mountain-tops, or the wind moaning over the ocean, deified his own fears, and made his graven image of Jupiter Tonans, or the demon of the southwest wind. Thus, gradually, there sprang up that army of "other gods" whom the Israelites so persistently "sought after," and the prophets so ruthlessly "cut off." As time went on, the evil deities gained in popularity, at the expense of the good, for the worshipers, convinced that their deities were of like passions with themselves, came naturally to devote themselves less to adoring those they regarded as benign, than to placating those they were convinced were inimical. A single example, taken from the nature-worship out of which idolatry grew, will be sufficient.

To the primitive people, little accustomed to going down to the sea in ships, the ocean presented a picture of fury and desolation which found expression in their acceptance of it as the type of evil and chaos. When darkness fell over the tempest-driven waters, it seemed as though evil had made itself master of all, and consequently the rising sun brought hope and courage to their hearts. In this way, the eastern tribesmen, accustomed to personify every object, adopted the word "Tehom," as the type of evil. It is a Semitic word, commonly derived by Hebraists from the verb *hum*, which is supposed to have originated from the sound of the incoming tide. In our own language, we still have it in the "humming tide" of Milton and the "hoaming sea" of Dryden. The writer of the Elohist document of Genesis uses it to signify chaos, constructing his sentence, as Dr. Palmer points out,

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

without the article, so as to necessitate the translation, "Darkness was upon the face of deep." This word, "Tehom," is a type of evil. It is the equivalent of the Assyrian "Tiamat," and of a long line of synonyms stretching through the languages of the world.

This personification of the restless power of evil, typified by the heaving sea, gradually took the form of a monster, the dragon of darkness; and so the dragon passed into the folk-lore of the world as the personification of evil, whether in the Assyrian tablets, the apocryphal book of "Bel and the Dragon," the Revelation of John, the mythology of Europe, the legends of the Ojibway Indians, or the ballads of the nursery.

STORY OF MERODACH

No matter, however, to what extent a belief in the power of evil may be embedded in the human consciousness, nothing can destroy the consciousness of the reality and power of good. In this way it came to pass that even while the legend of "Tiamat" was being spun, an understanding of Truth was manifesting itself in the story of "Merodach." Merodach was the Sun-god, rising, no matter how dark or tempestuous the night, to scatter his chariots over the horizon, in the dawn, lifting his head, as Jeremy Taylor puts it, over the eastern hills, "thrusting out his golden horns, like those which decked the brow of Moses." The victory of Merodach is, perhaps, the earliest indication of the human realization of the inevitable victory of Truth over error. We meet it no matter where we turn; in the story of Apollo and the Python, in that of St. George and the Dragon, and nowhere more clearly than in the narratives of the Bible.

The Bible is an eastern book, filled, as an eastern book would be, with all the allegory and imagery of expression inherent in the eastern mind. It is not a book, as is sometimes argued, of verbal inspiration, so sacred in every letter that not even "the blessed word Mesopotamia" could be deleted without sacrilege. It is a series of documents, *biblia*,

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

composed by men in different ages and of different grades of spiritual understanding, for the purpose of unfolding the evolution of Truth in the human consciousness. Here, at the very outset, we have the sea, "Tehom," taken as the type of evil, and the serpent, or dragon, as the personification of it, and here we have the omnipotence of good proclaimed: "And the Spirit of God moved upon the face of the waters. And God said, Let there be light: and there was light."

MEANING OF THE DELUGE

When the wickedness of the earth grew to such a pitch that of mortal man it could only be said that "every imagination of the thoughts of his heart was only evil continually," what Mrs. Eddy has termed, on page 405 of *Science and Health*, the necessity of sin to destroy itself, was expressed in the deluge. Noah, however, and his household, found safety in the ark, riding out, in their perception of Truth, the storm, the bounds of whose destroying power are shown, from one end of the Bible to the other, to be controllable through spiritual understanding: "Hitherto shalt thou come, but no further: and here shall thy proud waves be stayed."

It was into the sea, into error, that Jonah fell, when he was swallowed by the tannin, the sea monster, or personification of error. It was from the sea that the dragon of Revelation arose, and it was into the sea that it was cast back; and just as the book of Genesis opens with the announcement that "the Spirit of God moved upon the face of the waters," so the book of Revelation closes with the intimation of "a new heaven and a new earth: for the first heaven and the first earth were passed away; and there was no more sea."

To the people for whose guidance these books were written, evil was very real and very powerful. They personified it, not merely as the serpent or the dragon, not only as the devil or Satan, but as behemoth and leviathan, the hippopotamus and the alligator, which very naturally form the crest of the Society of Apothecaries; as Beelzebub and Rahab,

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

and by innumerable other names. These various deities all in time became endowed with powers for afflicting the human race, and in their train there arose that army of false prophets and false priests, proclaiming and serving them, and that crowd of magicians and diviners, astrologers and necromancers, sorcerers and wizards, all professing to be able to control the evil spirits and enlist them as the servants of man.

ALWAYS CONSIDERED ILLICIT

What the methods employed by these wonder-workers exactly were, it is perhaps impossible to say, but from the very earliest times the best kings and the prophets of Israel waged a war of extermination against them. That the method of the magicians was some species of mental manipulation there is no question, and that it was very far from being innocuous is quite positive. The magicians of Egypt, who represented a sort of sacred college, were no mere tricksters. The necromancers who, like the witch of Endor, called up the dead, produced some mental condition capable of receiving the desired impression. One thing is certain, that the purer the monotheism of Israel became, the more illicit and nefarious the various arts of the diviners were recognized to be.

The captivity brought the Israelites more than ever in contact with the magicians of Babylon, but though, after the return to Jerusalem, the influences at work were rather those of Egypt, the method of exorcism, extensively in use in Babylon, was imported to Palestine, where, during the first century of the Christian era, it became an almost regular practice. There was nothing more material about the methods of the exorcists than about those of the other occult workers. They worked by means of incantations, what we should call formulas today, of which Josephus gives us a specimen, which he attributes to Solomon.

Like all other occult workers, they appeared to have called on

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

what sometimes were regarded as powers of light, and sometimes powers of darkness, and it was this, coupled with the knowledge of the perpetual battle which had been maintained for centuries against "other gods," to which the scribes and Pharisees alluded when, to prejudice in the eyes of "the common people," the healing done by Jesus, they declared, "This fellow doth not cast out devils, but by Beelzebub the prince of the devils."

THE DIVINE ARGUMENT

The reply of Jesus, in the light of the fact that exorcism was no doubt practised quite commonly and quite openly, without reproof from the hierarchy, must have been crushing: "Every kingdom divided against itself is brought to desolation; and every city or house divided against itself shall not stand: and if Satan cast out Satan, he is divided against himself; how shall then his kingdom stand? And if I by Beelzebub cast out devils, by whom do your children cast them out? therefore they shall be your judges. But if I cast out devils by the Spirit of God, then the kingdom of God is come unto you."

In these words Jesus, in the clearest possible manner, drew the line, once and for all, between Christian healing and healing by occultism or mental suggestion of any description. The Pharisees, perfectly conscious that the exorcists had been professing to cast out devils by appealing to all sorts of deities, were silenced.

The reply of Jesus went, however, much deeper than this, and dealt, in a sentence, with the claim of mortal mind to heal the inharmonies of its own creation. It must be remembered that divine healing is not confined to physical diseases. It covers the whole gamut of material inharmony, whether of sickness or disease, of pain or accident, of poverty or sorrow, of sensuality or sin. Jesus said to the paralytic man, "Whether is easier, to say, Thy sins be forgiven thee; or to say, Arise, and walk?"

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

Mrs. Eddy puts the same truth in different words on page 210 of Science and Health, when she says: "Jesus healed sickness and sin by one and the same metaphysical process." Sin, again, covers something far larger than the infringement of a definite moral code. If this were not so, sin would become a geographical and temporal expression. Jesus showed this plainly, in the course of the sermon on the mount, when, after enumerating the things which men should and should not do, he wound up with the famous phrase, "Be ye therefore perfect, even as your Father which is in heaven is perfect."

SIN OF OMISSION

There is, of course, the sin of commission, which lies in the infringement of an accepted moral code, but there is no less the sin of omission, which consists in believing in anything apart from God; the one might be expressed in the conscious breaking of the commandments, the other, in the failure to live in consonance with the beatitudes.

Christian healing, then, is the attempt to destroy in the human consciousness the belief that there is life, power, substance, or intelligence apart from God, and if this is successfully accomplished, all the beliefs of materiality vanish like the unrealities they are. "Mortal mind," Mrs. Eddy writes, on page 178 of Science and Health, "acting from the basis of sensation in matter, is animal magnetism; but this so-called mind, from which comes all evil, contradicts itself, and must finally yield to the eternal Truth, or the divine Mind, expressed in Science."

All occult working is a species of mental manipulation. The witch of Endor did not reincarnate Samuel, but she did superinduce in Saul the belief that he was in the presence of the prophet. The vagabond Jews, the exorcists of Ephesus, certainly produced on the minds of those over whom they exercised their incantations some impression which expressed itself in a physical result. The whole process was one

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

of mental suggestion, and that process, whether under the name of necromancy or exorcism, of astrology or divination, of enchantment or witchcraft, of mesmerism or hypnotism, is simply the result of that conscious or unconscious belief in animal magnetism which Mrs. Eddy has explained, on page 103 of *Science and Health*, in saying: "As named in *Christian Science*, animal magnetism or hypnotism is the specific term for error, or mortal mind. It is the false belief that mind is in matter, and is both evil and good; that evil is as real as good and more powerful. This belief has not one quality of Truth."

THE HOUSE DIVIDED

Christian Science is founded entirely on the Bible, and anybody who will compare the words of Jesus with the two extracts just quoted from *Science and Health* will see how completely they agree. Mortal mind, Mrs. Eddy says, contradicts itself, and this is exactly what Jesus explained by describing it as a house divided against itself. Again, mortal mind, as she says, is the belief that mind is in matter and is both good and evil. It was this very belief in the power of good and evil which Jesus exposed as a house divided against a house, and it was this very belief in the possibility of effecting healing through the action of the human mind, which is itself fully imbued with the belief in good and evil, which he repudiated in claiming that true healing was wrought by the Spirit of God.

The claim of the human mind that it is possible to do good through suggestion is absolutely inseparable from the claim that it is possible to do evil. The statement is beginning to be circulated that hypnotic suggestion is a healing method through the operation of which no harm can come. There is, however, no fragment of justification for this, and the opposite of this has been brought out in the clearest manner in the courts of Europe within the last few years.

It is urged sometimes in defense of the use of suggestion that suggestions of evil can only be implanted in a mind with a natural

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

tendency in the direction of the suggestion made. This is in itself a sufficiently damning excuse, as it would place everybody under a certain moral level at the mercy of the hypnotist.

BELIEF IN EVIL

The fact is that no one has ever yet had the hardihood to deny that the human mind is largely permeated with a belief in the power and reality of evil. Consequently, when the theory of mental manipulation is imparted to this mind, it is let loose to thrust out suggestions of good or evil in every direction. This is precisely the mental condition typified by Jesus as a house divided against a house, and, as he said, such a house cannot stand.

The writer of the Jehovistic document of the book of Genesis put the same statement equally forcibly in the allegory of the tree of the knowledge of good and evil, the eating of which he declared would produce death. This statement has been constantly quoted without those who have quoted it perceiving what it fully implies. Death, Paul wrote to the Romans, entered the world through sin. It is therefore obvious that a belief in good and evil constituted what in Paul's opinion was sin, and it is therefore impossible to maintain, from a Christian point of view, that healing can proceed from a mind conscious of good and evil. What would proceed from such a source is, as the Bible clearly states, death, and so, necessarily, sickness and inharmony of every description. Now Jesus said that it was impossible to obtain figs from thorns, or grapes from a bramble bush. It is, therefore, as evident as anything can be that a mind believing in the reality of both good and evil, and so predisposed to death, is incapable of healing sickness.

THE POWER THAT HEALS

What does heal sickness Jesus put quite clearly in the very

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

answer in which he disposed of the human mind as a healing agency. "If," he said, "I cast out devils by the Spirit of God, then the kingdom of God is come unto you." The kingdom of God never came upon any man by suggestion from a mind torn by human passions and believing now in good and now in evil. The kingdom of God comes to man exactly in the proportion in which he acquires the Mind which was in Christ Jesus, for the possession of the Mind of Christ frees man from a belief in the lie of evil.

In that terrific mental battle with the Jews, recorded in the eighth chapter of John, which ended in the attempt to stone him, Jesus referred once more to the belief in evil producing death, in a way that has generally escaped attention. "Ye are of your father the devil," he said, "and the lusts of your father ye will do. He was a murderer from the beginning, and abode not in the truth, because there is no truth in him. When he speaketh a lie, he speaketh of his own: for he is a liar, and the father of it." Speaking in a manner which would be quite intelligible to those he was addressing, he personified evil in a way strange and almost incomprehensible to western ears. The Hebrew, however, who, it has been truly said, never opened his mouth without emitting a metaphor, took the substantive Satan, or adversary, and personified it as a synonym for evil, just as he took the adjective belial, worthless, and used it in the same way. Evil, Jesus said, was a murderer from the beginning, from the moment when the eating of the fruit of the tree of the knowledge of good and evil first brought death into the world. Yet, he added, the whole thing is a lie, which abode not in the truth, because there is no truth in it. Take away the imagery of the east, reduce the phrase to the matter-of-fact English of the twentieth century, and what does it amount to but this: in reality the lie never existed, because there is no reality in it. This is the truth, and the truth in exposing the lie strips it of its claim to reality and power. "Ye shall know the truth, and the truth shall make you free."

ABSOLUTE AND RELATIVE

A great thinker of the last century, equally famous as a churchman and a scholar, has shown how the apostle John, by a particular use of the definite article, has separated the absolute from the relative throughout the fourth gospel. In the sentence just quoted the definite article is emphatically used, so that it is the knowledge, not of any mere relative sense of truth, but of absolute Truth, which is to free the world. Now, a knowledge of absolute Truth is a knowledge of God, and thus, in the epistles, we find an expression translated knowledge of God, but which should, of course, be translated full, exact, that is absolute, or scientific, knowledge of God. This truth, says Dr. Westcott, which is to make men free, is expressed in "perfect conformity to the absolute — to that which is. Intellectually this conformity is knowledge of the truth: morally, obedience to the divine law."

The absolute, howbeit, is spiritual, and spiritual things can be only spiritually discerned. It follows, consequently, that a knowledge of absolute Truth can be gained only through spiritual perception, and never through the human intellect, confined, by the very reason of its belief in good and evil, to a belief in the relative. A knowledge of the absolute sweeps away any recognition of duality, and leaves good enthroned as omnipotence, — "Hear, O Israel: The Lord our God is one Lord."

Just, however, as Truth is necessarily absolute, so law is necessarily absolute. Law which admits good and evil to equal or even unequal copartnership implies either that the tree which bears the fruit of death, the knowledge of good and evil, was planted by the divine Mind, conscious only of infinite Life, Truth, and Love, or else a recognition of many gods. The first is a metaphysical impossibility. The second a metaphysical absurdity, which promotes animal magnetism in all its phases, mesmerism, hypnotism, and mental suggestion, to power, and exclaims: "These be thy gods, O Israel"!

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

It is common among those matter-of-fact people who believe what they are pleased to call common sense to be science, to sneer at metaphysics. If they would only read a certain essay of Huxley's on this subject they might have an occasional qualm. "By way of escape," he wrote, "from the metaphysical will-o'-the-wisps generated in the marshes of literature and theology, the serious student is sometimes bidden to betake himself to the solid ground of physical science. But the fish of immortal memory, who threw himself out of the frying-pan into the fire, was not more ill-advised than the man who seeks sanctuary from philosophical persecution within the walls of the observatory or of the laboratory."

"COMMON SENSE" PHILOSOPHY

The meaning of this is plain enough, and may be shown by two illustrations of Huxley's own in another essay. The common sense philosopher who looks at the sky is absolutely positive that the sun rises and sets. So certain were people of this that in medieval Europe those who dared to question it were in danger of prison or death. Today, the person who questions it is in danger merely of being thought a fool.

Another illustration may bring the matter down to our own times. The common sense person is convinced that pain is in a wound. If you were to tell him that it was not within "two feet of it," he would proceed to tell you that his senses convinced him that it was. When, however, he turns to the laboratory, the scientist answers by telling him that pain "is a state of consciousness." The moral is obvious. The teaching in Christian Science of the unreality of matter is not a bit more ridiculous to the common sense philosopher of today than the statement that the sun was stationary was ridiculous to the medieval inquisitor; while the statement that pain is mental, however ridiculous it may be to the common sense philosopher, is not ridiculous to the laboratory. "Of all the dangerous mental habits," to complete Huxley's

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

summing up, "that which schoolboys call 'cocksureness' is probably the most perilous; and the inestimable value of metaphysical discipline is that it furnishes an effectual counterpoise to this evil proclivity."

The great teachers of idealism in natural science have never pretended that, because matter was a mere phenomenon, and so absolutely unreal, it was not relatively a fact to the human consciousness. They have never doubted, any more than that sardonic materialistic Pilate, that life could be destroyed. Jesus of Nazareth, whom orthodox Christianity has proclaimed God, and sympathetic agnosticism as the greatest of ethical teachers, was in reality, as Mrs. Eddy has pointed out, on page 313 of *Science and Health*, "the most scientific man that ever trod the globe." He knew that Life is God, and therefore spiritual and indestructible. The necromancers, speaking in the supposed shrill voices of Sheol, in what Virgil calls a ghost of a voice, called up shades which they claimed to be the dead; Christ Jesus, standing in the mouth of the tomb in Bethany, cried in a loud voice, "Lazarus, come forth." He had won, by complete obedience to divine law, the understanding of absolute Truth, and was far better able to demonstrate it than the natural scientist of today is able to demonstrate his knowledge of the relative truth of chemistry.

ANIMAL MAGNETISM

The priests of Asklepios muttered their incantations, and encouraged their patients by a view of the snakes which represented the deity. Jesus of Nazareth healed every manner of sickness with a word, and had no need of the formula of the exorcists. Now, the necromancers no more believed that they raised the dead with their incantations, than the priests of Asklepios imagined that the harmless, hooded snakes of the temples healed the sick. Both of them knew perfectly well that they used these means to suggest to their patients what they desired.

Because, after a lapse of centuries, occultism has found new

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

names and new methods, it is not any the less the expression of animal magnetism. The knowledge of the Christ, of Truth, which constituted the Mind which was in Christ Jesus, healed the sick scientifically by destroying the lie which produced the belief of sickness. But animal magnetism, as Mrs. Eddy writes on page 102 of *Science and Health*, "has no scientific foundation, for God governs all that is real, harmonious, and eternal, and His power is neither animal nor human. Its basis being a belief and this belief animal, in Science animal magnetism, mesmerism, or hypnotism is a mere negation, possessing neither intelligence, power, nor reality, and in sense it is an unreal concept of the so-called mortal mind."

It is perfectly clear from all this that Jesus drew a distinct line between the spiritual fact expressed in divine law and the material fact expressed in physical law. The first is absolute, the second relative; the first eternal, the second temporal. He never said that sin, disease, and death did not seem desperately real to the human consciousness; he admitted that they were so relatively true as to need to be shown to be untrue, and he explained that this demonstration could be made only through the understanding of absolute Truth. In the same way he did not say that the occult workers did not produce an effect so far as the human senses were concerned, but he showed in the raising of Lazarus, and in the casting out of devils, and healing the sick, the difference between mental suggestion and the operation of divine law.

OCCULTISM AND SPIRITUALITY

It would be interesting to know whether the exponents of suggestion are prepared to consign the Bible to the scrap-heap of Haggardic literature, and to maintain that the occultism and esoteric magic of the east is an old wife's tale, to be dismissed with the airy humor with which Lord Byron disposed of the Berkeley ballads. Because, if not, if these things had a foundation in belief, if we have their descendants in the mesmerism, hypnotism, and mental suggestion of today, is Christian Science, which, as its discoverer and

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

Founder, Mrs. Eddy, has told us, is built up on the Bible, wrong for drawing the distinction Jesus drew between occultism and spiritual healing, and showing the world how to protect itself against the one by relying on the other?

To describe Christian Science as the apotheosis of fear, for teaching the world how to protect itself against animal magnetism, is just about as sensible as to accuse Paul of being a coward for advising Christians to protect themselves with the whole armor of God. Fear, as ordinarily defined, is the mental effect produced on people by the belief of an inability to defend themselves against a power stronger than themselves. Relatively speaking, this is accurate enough, but, speaking absolutely and scientifically, fear is the belief that man is material and not spiritual, for if he were known to be spiritual there would be nothing to fear for him.

WHAT LOVE IS

What love is, from a relative human standpoint, it would be difficult to say. It would take too long to attempt to reconcile the various definitions, but, scientifically, love is either a synonym for God, or an attribute of God, and it is so used in an absolute sense in the Bible. Relatively speaking, the more human beings love one another, the greater is their fear when danger threatens the object of their love, but in the exact proportion in which their love is made perfect, in which, that is to say, it realizes that man is spiritual and not material, and is consequently not under any relative human law, the fear vanishes in the perception of divine protection. Thus, "perfect love casteth out fear."

Animal magnetism is essentially the belief that man is material; how then Christian Science, which teaches the exact reverse, can produce fear, it is quite impossible to say. The fact, of course, is precisely the other way. Everywhere the critics of Christian Science are bearing witness to the joy and peace noticeable in the lives of Christian

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

Scientists.

Let us take two instances only, and these from the ranks of the two professions, in the very nature of things most inimical to Christian Science. The Archbishop of York, speaking, not long ago, at the York Diocesan Conference, asked how they were to account for the lives Christian Scientists lived. "He could only say that he had rarely met with such capacity to enter some of the deeper aspects of truth, and he had seen the lives of Christian Scientists, tranquil, bright, cheerful." "They [his own church] ought," he continued, "to have had all along the elixir of life to give to their people. Had they lost it? Why was it that they so seldom met in the ranks of their own people any one of whom a visitor from Mars would say, 'What is the secret of that man's or that woman's life?' that radiant sense of the supernatural, that brightness and reality of spirit?"

The other profession is of course that of medicine; and in a letter, not very long ago, to the *Daily Mail*, Dr. John Shaw, of Harley street, a man with a great London practice, wrote, "I am not a Christian Scientist, but I believe in what I should regard as the essential tenet of their creed, and which I might sum up in the words, 'The Lord's hand is not shortened, that it cannot save.'"

TWO TESTIMONIES

Here, then, are two men, distinguished in their professions, speaking from personal knowledge and observation, dwelling on the extraordinary absence of fear in the lives of Christian Scientists, and on the tranquillity and radiancy which pervade them.

The archbishop asks, What is the secret of it all? Well, it is this — that Christian Scientists have learned that spiritual things are not supernatural, as he imagines, but divinely natural, and, in consequence, they do not fall into the mistake of crying, "Lo here! or, lo there!" — "for, behold, the kingdom of God is within you." The fact

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

is, that Mrs. Eddy has taught Christian Scientists how to master and control the animal propensities which make for fear, anxiety, and unrest in the human consciousness. These propensities John described as "the lust of the flesh, and the lust of the eyes, and the pride of life," and it is through the supposititious existence of these things that conscious and unconscious suggestion reaches the human mind. It was because he possessed the Mind of Christ, that Jesus was able to say, "The prince of this world cometh, and hath nothing in me." "Evil thoughts, lusts, and malicious purposes cannot go forth, like wandering pollen," Mrs. Eddy writes, on page 234 of *Science and Health*, "from one human mind to another, finding unsuspected lodgment, if virtue and truth build a strong defence."

BELIEF IN WITCHCRAFT

The wonder-workers of the east, before the Christian era, knew something — we shall, perhaps, never know exactly how much — of mental suggestion, and that knowledge passed, to some extent, into Europe, through the Roman empire, in the days of the astrologers and wizards, and found at last concrete expression in the belief of witchcraft. Because, however, many innocent and harmless creatures were tortured as witches, this does not prove that animal magnetism, in the form of witchcraft, did not exist, though these sufferers may have known nothing of it. A recent critic has reproduced two illustrations, one of "a lemon pierced with nails; a Neapolitan method of invoking evil influences," and the other, "a pig's heart transfixed with pins and thorns — an English rustic's malicious charm." He seems to think that these two instances of gross superstition advance his case in proving a belief in malicious animal magnetism to be the nightmare of ignorance. He does not seem to know that they are but links in a chain of mental suggestion, one end of which is lost in the twilight of history in the east, while the other is anchored in London, New York, and Rome, and the other great cities of today.

The magicians of the east made their figures of clay to represent

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

their victims, just like the Neapolitan peasant or the English rustic, and studded them with nails, not because they imagined that that mere act was going to have any effect, but as a means of fixing in their thought the fears and sensations they wished to impart mentally. This was in the days before Sir Kenelm Digby had started his theory of animal attraction, or Paracelsus that of the magnetic system, a doctrine which in due time Goelenius described as witchcraft. Now, it does not matter an atom whether Goelenius was right or wrong. Here we have traveling down the centuries the belief in animal magnetism, called now by this name, and now by that, carrying with it a load of fear and detestation, venting itself, as such things always do, in cruelty and hatred, and creating a snowball of mental belief in the power of evil.

ABOUT INTELLECTUALITY

It has been said that as knowledge grew, superstition vanished. The writer of the Book of Ecclesiastes puts matters a little differently: "Then said I, Wisdom is better than strength: nevertheless the poor man's wisdom is despised, and his words are not heard," a saying approximating to that in Proverbs, "The knowledge of the holy is understanding." Here, then, are the writers of two of the great wisdom books of the Bible, pointing out that the knowledge which destroys ignorance is not expressed in intellectual pride, but in a knowledge of the spiritual, that very scientific knowledge of God, spoken of in the epistles. A great Chinese philosopher, writing six centuries before the Christian era, declared that if there was no evil in the human consciousness, wisdom would be at least innocuous, but that as there was more evil than good, it merely converted the ignorant knave into the dangerous knave. "Reason," Mrs. Eddy writes, on page 327 of *Science and Health*, "is the most active human faculty. Let that inform the sentiments and awaken the man's dormant sense of moral obligation, and by degrees he will learn the nothingness of the pleasures of human sense and the grandeur and bliss of a spiritual sense, which silences the material or corporeal."

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

Now, as the ignorant malice of the rustic, sticking thorns in his pig's heart, gave place little by little to the cultivated human knowledge of the mesmerist or the hypnotist, the belief of power in evil seemed to grow in intensity, "The mild forms of animal magnetism," Mrs. Eddy writes, on page 102 of *Science and Health* "are disappearing, and its aggressive features are coming to the front. The looms of crime, hidden in the dark recesses of mortal thought, are every hour weaving webs more complicated and subtle." To pretend that the looms of crime are not perpetually weaving evil is to shut your eyes to the relative fact of the existence of evil as a belief in the human mind; but, in proportion as the teaching of Christian Science is assimilated, the student learns to watch, less with consternation and more with amusement, the labors of the weavers, spinning the thread which, like the cloth in the famous fairy-tale of "The King's New Clothes," has no existence. The only true thing that can be said about evil is that it is a lie, and the only power a lie can ever even seem to simulate is the temporary sense of power which a lie appears to exert so long as it is believed in. "Ye shall know the truth, and the truth shall make you free."

METHODS OF HEALING

That the employer of mental suggestion, with his focus narrowed to the range of human intelligence, should find it impossible to detach science from an examination of secondary causes or physical facts, and to extend it to an understanding of primary causes or spiritual facts, is not remarkable. The remarkable thing is that people who are not held within the immediate thrall of a belief in mental suggestion should be willing to conclude that any one knows more of Christian Science than a Christian Scientist does.

The complete failure of the employer of mental suggestion to get beyond his own view of mental practice is made manifest the moment he attempts to deal critically with Christian Science. To argue, for instance, that a Christian Science practitioner treats a patient by

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

ignoring symptoms, while an ordinary medical practitioner attacks the cause, is not merely absurd, it is a practical reversal of the position. To the Christian Scientist, as well as to the doctor, a symptom is an indication of a cause. To the doctor, believing disease to be purely material, the cause is always a material one, and the patient is dealt with as if he represented so much matter. To the Christian Scientist the cause is always a mental one, even though it is expressed physically, and the treatment is therefore directed to eradicating the mental cause. It will be seen from this that the medical practitioner is a materialist, while the Christian Scientist is an idealist, for, speaking roughly, the difference between idealism and materialism consists of this — that the materialist conceives of mind as contained in matter, whereas the idealist conceives of matter as contained in mortal mind.

MEANING OF SYMPTOMS

Now, the symptoms of consumption may originate in a variety of causes. To the doctor those causes are physical. He proceeds to attack the physical cause, and, as far as this goes, he is correct. The Christian Scientist goes deeper than this; he goes to the mental cause in which all apparently material causation has its origin. The consequence is, that instead of confining himself to the physical cause, as the doctor does, and trying to destroy that, he attacks the mental cause which lies behind the apparent physical cause, with the result that, if he is successful, the disease is destroyed for ever, and no relapse is possible.

For instance, a doctor treating a case of consumption never gives credit for the fact that the physical conditions producing the symptoms originate in mind. The consequence is that, even if he succeeds in temporarily overcoming one physical condition, he leaves another physical condition capable of, at any moment, again producing consumptive symptoms. The Christian Scientist, on the other hand, regarding the physical cause of the disease as merely a mental result, attacks the mental cause, which may be a dozen different things of

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

which the doctor has never dreamed, and if this is destroyed it is absolutely mentally obliterated, and is entirely incapable of reasserting itself.

The employer of mental suggestion who attempts to treat a case of disease can succeed only in inducing the patient to believe that he has not got this disease. This simply means that as long as the manipulation of the patient's mind continues the operation of the mental causes producing the disease is held back. The moment, however, that the treatment ceases the mind reverts to its former attitude, and the symptoms, in an aggravated form, return. It is like putting a weight on a turned-back spring: the moment the weight is removed the spring swings back to its former position.

METHODS NOT AKIN

Not long ago, a gentleman who had practised healing by mental suggestion and who was well known as a mental healer of this description, called on me. He informed me that he had employed this practice for between three and four years, with the result that he had noticed that practically every nominal case of healing was followed by an eventual relapse. He also informed me that, while practising mental suggestion, he had watched many cases of Christian Science healing, and observed that the relapses were practically non-existent. The results so impressed him that he came to ask for an explanation of the difference between the two systems. When the explanation was given to him, he saw with perfect clearness the difference between the two, and admitted, not only that there was no connection, but that the methods employed were as far apart as the poles. One inevitable result of mental suggestion is to weaken the normal will-power of the patient, with the result that, if it is employed in connection with ordinary medical treatment, the vital force of the patient is so weakened that he is apt to sink under the medical or surgical treatment.

The difference between faith-healing and Christian Science is

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

apparent from this, and it will be seen that the use of drugs is absolutely as much faith-healing as an appeal to an anthropomorphic deity. The witch doctor who succeeds in making a patient believe that by the propitiation of some deity his sickness can be removed, plays no more on the patient's faith than does the medical doctor who persuades a patient that certain physical conditions can be removed by a drug. The cause of disease being mental, what happens in each case is that the belief in the vagaries of the witch doctor, or the belief in the drug, produces the same effect.

"ABSENT" TREATMENT

The difference between Christian Science practice and every phase of mental suggestion is manifest in the fact that the Christian Scientist does not do what is termed, "place himself *en rapport*" with the patient. To say that a Christian Scientist treats a patient at a specific time by arrangement, during which time the patient places himself mentally at the disposal of the Christian Science practitioner, is simply to state something which every Christian Scientist knows to be ridiculous.

Perhaps the most perfect disproof of this exists in what is known as absent treatment. The practitioner who gives absent treatment has not the faintest conception where the patient is, or what he is doing at the moment he treats him, nor does he in the least care. His practice is based absolutely on the teaching of the Bible, and is entirely Christian. Jesus healed not only those who came to him directly for healing, but he healed those, as in the case of the centurion's servant, who were unable to come. The Christian Science practitioner talks to his patient, when the latter is present, and explains what the Christian Science teaching is, in order to show him how he may do without treatment, so that he may learn, through his own understanding of Christian Science, how to meet his own difficulties, but it is a matter of perfect indifference to him, as far as the actual treatment is concerned, whether the patient is in the room with him, conscious that he is being

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

treated, or a thousand miles off, unconscious of the moment at which he is being treated. What happens in either case is that the specific lie in which the patient is believing is destroyed in mortal mind and, being destroyed in mortal mind, vanishes from the consciousness of everybody concerned.

RIGHT TO INDEPENDENCE

When Christian Scientists are asked why they do not endeavor to close the hospitals and to destroy the contents of chemists' shops, they are tempted to smile at the question. To a Christian Scientist, every single person has a right to think for himself and to act for himself. If he thinks he is benefited by being operated upon for appendicitis, in spite of the deadly record of operations for appendicitis, no Christian Scientist would think of interfering with him. If he thinks that his health can be improved by drenching himself in drugs, in spite of the record of drugs in the past, no Christian Scientist would dream of depriving him of them. If he thinks it is scientific practice which confines one generation of consumptive patients in rooms from which every breath of air is excluded, and exposes the other on balconies where every breath of air reaches them, no Christian Scientist would attempt to prevent him from adopting either alternative.

Christian Scientists know perfectly well that the way to convert people is by demonstration, not by persecution. The doctors who, knowing the absolute failure of medical science to meet the woes of humanity, would yet attempt to force mankind to accept that treatment, whether they liked it or not, are not one whit advanced beyond the Inquisition, which attempted to make men accept religious views which were repugnant to them, and will be every whit as unsuccessful. The most dangerous campaign upon which a government or a nation can embark is one of persecution, no matter how skilfully it may be wrapped up in legal quibbles. The day is past forever when it can be hoped that thought can be burned in the market-place or

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

imprisoned in a dungeon. Thought is free, and freedom of thought will always remain, as it always has remained, to confound persecutors, no matter what temporary advantage may have seemed to accrue to them through the torture of what they believed to be matter. Whatever else may or may not occur, the doom of the persecutor is inevitable and irrevocable. Mind does not pass away with the body.

END OF PERSECUTION

Christian Science is a little too big to be dealt with in the drastic way so amiably suggested by some of its critics. An enormous number of thoughtful men and women, respected by those among whom they move in their daily life, are not to be intimidated or suppressed by the clamor or threats generated by the intolerance of those who differ from them. They claim the right, and they will maintain the right, to worship God in their own way, even though that way may not be in accordance with the practice of others. It is a curious commentary on the centuries of the growth of what is termed liberty and the observance of what is named Christianity that the human mind should still show indications of a desire to confine liberty to orthodoxy and to measure Christianity by compulsion. The spirit which cast Daniel into the lions' den, and Shadrach, Meshach, and Abednego into the fiery furnace, has changed its cry, and that is all. The Romans threw the Christians to the lions. When the throne of the Caesars gave place to the chair of St. Peter, the Christians bound the heretic to the stake. The crowd which attended the *auto da fe* was as barbarian and brutal as the crowd which screamed on the tiers of the amphitheater. When the Anglican took the place of the Romanist in the seat of Augustine, the rack was exchanged for the boot and the stake for the pillory and the cart-tail. When nonconformity, escaping from the pillory and the cart-tail, established itself in power, it proved that it was just as possible to play the persecutor in a steeple-crowned hat as in a shovel one. Even when the Anglican regained his power the methods altered, but not the spirit, and though

CHRISTIAN SCIENCE HEALING *versus* MENTAL SUGGESTION

Whitfield preached to the colliers grim,
Bishops in lawn sleeves preached at him.

Christian Science has come, among other things, to teach the world something of what love really means, — to show it that love is the fulfilling of the law, but that this law is not a human law, but the law condensed in the saying: "A new commandment I give unto you, That ye love one another; as I have loved you, that ye also love one another."